Environmental Law, Policy, and Economics

Reclaiming the Environmental Agenda

Nicholas A. Ashford
Charles C. Caldart

The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

© 2008 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information about special quantity discounts, please email special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu

This book was set in Times New Roman on 3B2 by Asco Typesetters, Hong Kong.
Printed on recycled paper and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Ashford, Nicholas Askounes.
Environmental law, policy, and economics : reclaiming the environmental agenda / Nicholas A. Ashford, Charles C. Caldart.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-0-262-01238-6 (hardcover : alk. paper) 1. Environmental law—United States. 2. Environmental policy—United States. I. Caldart, Charles C. II. Title.
KF3775.A967 2007
344.7304′6—dc22

2007001995

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Contents in Detail

1 The Nature and Origins of Environmental Contamination 1

A. The Nature of the Problem: Pollution and Accidental Releases of Chemicals into the Environment 2

- *Christiani, David C. and Woodin, Mark A., "Specific Air Pollutants Associated with Adverse Respiratory Effects," from Life Support: The Environment and Human Health, pp. 15–37 (2002)* 3
- *Hu, Howard and Kim, Nancy K., "Drinking-Water Pollution and Human Health," from Critical Condition: Human Health and the Environment, pp. 31–48 (1993)* 5
- *Bowen, E. and Hu, H., "Food Contamination Due to Environmental Pollution," from Critical Condition: Human Health and the Environment, pp. 49–69 (1993)* 12
- *Montague, Peter, "Environmental Trends," Rachel's Environment and Health Weekly, no. 613, August 27 (1998)* 17
- *Roe, David, et al., Environmental Defense Fund, "Executive Summary," from Toxic Ignorance: The Continuing Absence of Basic Health Testing for Top-Selling Chemicals in the United States (1997)* 19

B. The Causes of Pollution and Accidental Releases 21

1. Increases in the Production and Use of Chemicals, and Changes in the Nature of Chemical Contamination 21

- *Commoner, Barry M., "A Reporter at Large: The Environment," The New Yorker, pp. 46–71, June 15 (1987)* 22

2. Public Goods, the Tragedy of the Commons, and Free-Rider Problems: The Destructiveness of Pursuing Narrow Self-Interest 23
- *Hardin, Garrett "The Tragedy of the Commons," 162 Science 1243, 1244–1245 (1968)* 23

a. Pursuing Self-Interest as a Pathway to an Improved Environment 25
- *Ridley, M. and Low, B. S., "Can Selfishness Save the Environment?," The Atlantic Monthly, pp. 76–86, September (1993)* 25

b. Moral Appeal 28
- *Durnil, G. K., "A Conservative Speaks," Rachel's Environment and Health Weekly, no. 424, January 12 (1995)* 28

3. Pollution as an Economic Problem 29
- *Ruff, Larry, "The Economic Common Sense of Pollution," from Economics of the Environment, pp. 3–19 (1972)* 30
- *Ashford, N. and Heaton, G., "Environmental and Safety Regulation: Reasons for their Adoption and Possible Effects on Technological Innovation," Environmental Policy and Law, vol. 1, pp. 171–172 (1975/76)* 33
- *Morgan, Granger, "Risk Management Should Be About Efficiency and Equity," from Environmental Science & Technology, pp. 32A–34A, January 1 (2000)* 34

4. Limits to Growth 35

C. Pollution and Accident Control, Mitigation, and Prevention 41

D. The Focus of Traditional Environmental Law 42

E. Beyond Pollution and Accident Control and Prevention: Sustainable Production and Products 43

2 Nature and Assessment of the Harm 45

A. Life Cycle Analysis and the Biological Impact Pathway 45
- *Ashford, N. A., Hattis, D. B., Heaton, G. R., Katz, J. I., Priest, W. C. and Zolt, E. M., "Life Cycle Models for the Production, Use, and Disposal of Chemicals," from Evaluating Chemical Regulations:*

Trade-off Analysis and Impact Assessment for Environmental Decision Making, pp. 19–25 (1980) 47
- *Ashford, N. A., Hattis, D. B., Heaton, G. R., Katz, J. I., Priest, W. C. and Zolt, E. M., "The Biological Impact Pathway," from Evaluating Chemical Regulations: Trade-off Analysis and Impact Assessment for Environmental Decision Making, pp. 20, 22–25 (1980)* 48

B. Environmental and Ecosystem Degradation 50
C. Human Health Risks 51
1. Classical Categorization: The Dose Makes the Poison 51
a. Exposure and Dose 51
b. Dose-Effect and Dose-Response Relationships 52
- *Ashford, N. A., "Exposure to Toxic Materials and Carcinogens," from Crisis in the Workplace, pp. 115–124 (1976)* 52
- *Ashford, N. A., Hattis, D. B., Heaton, G. R., Katz, J. I., Priest, W. C. and Zolt, E. M., "Relating Exposure to Damage," from Evaluating Chemical Regulations: Trade-off Analysis and Impact Assessment for Environmental Decision Making, pp. 5–25 to 5–27 (1980)* 58

c. Categorization of Health Effects Resulting from Exposures to Chemicals 61
- *Ashford, N. A., Hattis, D. B., Heaton, G. R., Katz, J. I., Priest, W. C. and Zolt, E. M., "Taxonomy of Biological Effects with Different Dose-Response Implications," from Evaluating Chemical Regulations: Trade-off Analysis and Impact Assessment for Environmental Decision Making, pp. 5–27 to 5–31 (1980)* 62

d. In vitro Studies 64
e. Structure-Activity Relationships 66
2. Multistage Disease Processes: The Dose Plus the Host Makes the Harm 66
a. Endocrine Disruption 67
- *Environmental Protection Agency, "Overview of the Endocrine Disruptor Issue," from Endocrine Disruptor Screening Program: Report to Congress (2000)* 67

b. Low-Level Chemical Sensitivity 69
- *Ashford, Nicholas A., "Low-Level Chemical Sensitivity: Implications for Research and Social Policy," from Toxicology and Industrial Health: Special Issues on Multiple Chemical Sensitivity, 15(3–4), pp. 421–427, April–June (1999)* 69

c. Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance: A New Theory of Disease? 73
- *Ashford, Nicholas A., and Miller, C. S., "Low-Level Exposures to Chemicals Challenge Both Science and Regulatory Policy," from Environmental Science and Technology, pp. 508A–509A, November (1998)* 73

d. Cancer, Repair Mechanisms, and Hormesis 75

D. The Basics (and Limitations) of Risk Assessment 77

1. Risk Assessment Methodology 77
- *Heyvaert, Veerle, "What Is Risk Assessment?," from Reconceptualizing Risk Assessment, Reciel 8(2): 135–143 (1999)* 77
- *Masters, G. M., "Risk Assessment," from Introduction to Environmental Engineering and Science, p. 117 et seq. (1998)* 78

2. The Limits of Risk Assessment 100
- *Heyvaert, Veerle, "[The]... Trouble with Risk Assessment," from Reconceptualizing Risk Assessment, Reciel 8(2): 135–143 (1999)* 100

3. Epidemiology 102
- *Monson, Richard, "Epidemiology and Risk," from Chemical Risk Assessment and Occupational Health, pp. 39–41 (1994)* 102
- *Teta, M. Jane, "Epidemiology in Occupational Health Risk Assessment," from Chemical Risk Assessment and Occupational Health, pp. 57–66 (1994)* 104
- *Needleman, Carolyn, "Applied Epidemiology and Environmental Health: Emerging Controversies," American Journal of Infection Control 25(3): 262–274 (1997)* 110

E. Scientific Uncertainty, Values, and Implications for Policy: Can a "Safe" Level of Exposure be Unequivocally Determined? 121

- *Ashford, N. A. and Miller, C. S., "Public Policy Response," Environmental Science and Technology 508A–509A, November (1998)* 122
- *Ashford, N. A., "Science and Values: Can They Be Separated," Statistical Science 3(3): 377–383 August (1988)* 123

3 Economics and the Environment 127

A. Introduction 128
B. The Economic Value of Environmental Amenities, Resources, and Quality 129
C. Market Imperfections as the Basis for Government Intervention 131
1. Externalities 132
2. Imperfect Information 135
3. Imperfect Competition 137
4. Market-Related Inequities and Injustices 138
D. Economic Efficiency and the Technological Dynamic 140
E. The Use of Cost-Benefit Analysis as a Means of Evaluating and Designing Options for Environmental Regulation 147
1. Problems in Estimating Environmental Policy Benefits 151
a. Valuing Health-Related Benefits 151
b. Valuing Environmental Resources and Amenities 153
2. Problems in Estimating Environmental Policy Costs: Static versus Dynamic Assumptions About Technological Responses 156
3. Problems in Selecting the Discount Rate 158
4. Problems of Equity and Ethics 161
5. Misuses and Abuses of Cost-Benefit Analysis 163
6. The Value of Transparency 166
7. Trade-off Analysis as an Alternative to Cost-Benefit Analysis 168
F. Prioritizing Environmental Problems Within and Among Different Problem Areas 169
1. Perceptual and Political Influences on Risk-Based Priority Setting 170
2. The Inherent Nonuniformity in Priority Setting 171
G. Law and Economics as Competing Frameworks for Environmental Decision Making: The Polluter Pays Principle and the Precautionary Principle 174
H. Schools of Economic Discourse and Policy Formulation 180
References 182

4 Addressing Pollution Through the Tort System 189

A. Introduction 190
1. The Common Law: Court-Made Law (and Policy) 190
2. The Relationship Between the Common Law and Statutory Law 193
B. The Tort System 196
1. The Basic Functions of Tort Law 196
2. The Available Remedies 199
a. Monetary Damages 199
b. Injunctive Relief 205
3. The Central Elements of a Tort Claim 206
a. In General 206
b. Tort Suits Against the Government 209
C. The Four Classic Environmental Tort Claims 210
1. Negligence 210
2. Nuisance 213
a. Private Nuisance 213
b. Public Nuisance 215
3. Trespass 217
4. Strict Liability for Abnormally Dangerous Activity 218
D. Products Liability Claims 221
• *Beshada v. Johns-Manville Products Corp., 447 A.2d 539 (N.J. 1982)* 223
E. The Technology-Forcing Potential of Tort Law 227
• *The T. J. Hooper 60 F.2d 737 (2d Cir. 1932)* 227
F. Drawbacks to Using the Tort System as a Pollution Reduction Tool 228
1. The Financial Investment Necessary to Mount a Credible Case 228
2. The Difficulty in Moving Beyond Current Industry Practice 229
3. The Difficulty in Proving Proximate Causation 230
4. The Difficulty in Presenting "Novel" Scientific or Engineering Testimony 232
5. The Lengthy Delay Between Causation and Remedy 233
6. The Difficulty in Securing an Injunction Against Ongoing Industrial Activity 233
• *Boomer et al. v. Atlantic Cement Company, Inc, .26 N.Y.2d 219, 257 N.E.2d 870 (1970)* 234

5 Administrative Law: The Roles of Congress, the President, the Agencies, and the Courts in Shaping Environmental Policy 241

A. Questions to Consider when Analyzing a Regulatory Framework 242
B. The Constitutional Basis for Health, Safety, and Environmental Regulation 244
1. Direction from the Legislative Branch 244
a. The Substantive Statutory Mandate 244
b. The Commerce Clause 245
c. The "Regulatory Takings" Issue 247
d. The Delegation Doctrine 249
e. The Procedural Mandate 252
f. Interpreting the Statutory Mandate 257
g. Statutory Amendment and Informal Controls 258
h. Federal Regulatory Authority and the States 259
• *New York v. United States, 505 U.S. 144 (1992)* 260
2. Direction from the Executive Branch 267
• *Schultz, William B. and Vladeck, David C., "An Obstacle to Public Safety," The Washington Post, May 10, 1988, p. 20* 268
3. Direction from the Judicial Branch 273
• *Ferguson, J. H. and McHenry, D. E., "Constitutional Courts," from The American System of Government, pp. 441–453 (1981)* 273
• *Llewellyn, K. N., "This Case System: What to Do with the Cases," from The Bramble Bush, pp. 41–45 (1981)* 280
• *Baker, Russell "Lawyers for Cars," The New York Times, June 8 (1983)* 283
C. Administrative Rulemaking 285
1. The Distinction between Rulemaking, Adjudication, and Enforcement 285
2. A General Look at Rulemaking under the Administrative Procedure Act 285
3. Negotiated Rulemaking 287
• *Susskind, Lawrence and McMahon, Gerard, "The Theory and Practice of Negotiated Rulemaking," from Yale Journal on Regulation 133 (1985)* 288
• *Caldart, Charles C. and Ashford, Nicholas A., "Negotiation as a Means of Developing and Implementing Environmental and Occupational*

Health and Safety Policy," from Harvard Environmental Law Review 141 (1999) 296
D. Citizen and Corporate Access to the Administrative Process 312
1. Initiation of Rulemaking 313
2. Access to Agency Proceedings and Records 313
3. Access to Advisory Committees 314
4. Access to the Courts 315
5. Monetary Limitations on the Availability of Review 320
6. Bypassing the Agency: Citizen Enforcement Through the Private Right of Action 321
E. The Role of the Courts in Reviewing Agency Decision Making 321
1. Five Judicial Limitations on Agency Authority 322
2. The Scope of Factual Review 322
• *Motor Vehicle Manufacturers' Association v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Company, 463 U.S. 29 (1983)* 325
3. Judicial Review of Agency Decisions Not to Act 330
F. Two General Environmental Mandates to Agencies: The National Environmental Policy Act and the Endangered Species Act 331
1. The National Environmental Policy Act 331
a. The Environmental Impact Statement 332
b. The Council on Environmental Quality 335
2. The Endangered Species Act 338

6 The Clean Air Act and the Regulation of Stationary Sources 343

A. Origins and Overview of the Clean Air Act 345
1. Origins 345
2. Structure and Overview of the Clean Air Act 347
B. The National Ambient Air Quality Standards for Criteria Pollutants 349
• *Lead Industries Association, Inc. v. Environmental Protection Agency, 647 F.2d 1130 (D.C. Cir. 1980)* 352
• *American Petroleum Institute v. Costle, 665 F.2d 1176 (D.C. Cir. 1981)* 369
• *American Lung Association v. Environmental Protection Agency, 884 F. Supp. 345 (D. Arizona 1994)* 377
• *American Trucking Associations, Inc. v. Environmental Protection Agency, 175 F.3d 1027 (D.C. Cir. 1999)* 381

- *Environmental Protection Agency v. American Trucking Associations, Inc, 531 U.S. 457 (2001)* 389

C. State Implementation Plans 396
- *Union Electric Co. v. Environmental Protection Agency, 427 U.S. 246 (1976)* 397

D. Additional Regulation of Stationary Sources 401
1. Section 111 Standards 401
   a. New Source Performance Standards 401
      i. In General 401
      ii. What Is a "New" or "Major Modified" Source? 402
         - *Portland Cement Association v. Ruckelshaus, 486 F.2d 375 (D.C. Cir. 1973)* 405
      iii. Alternative Standard-Setting Criteria 408
   b. Designated Pollutants 409
2. Additional Emission Standards Designed to Achieve or Maintain Ambient Air Quality Standards: Nonattainment and the Prevention of Significant Deterioration 410
   a. Nonattainment Policy 411
      i. In General 411
      ii. Specific Requirements for Ozone, CO, and Particulates 412
   b. Nondegradation Policy (Prevention of Significant Deterioration) 413
      i. In General 413
      ii. Specific Requirements 414
   c. The Applicability of the Bubble Policy in Nonattainment and PSD Areas 416
      - *Chevron U.S.A. Inc. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, 467 U.S. 837 (1984)* 416
3. Visibility Protection 423
   - *Central Arizona Water Conservation District v. United States Environmental Protection Agency, 990 F.2d 1531 (9th Cir. 1993)* 424
4. Acid Rain Controls and the SO_2 Allowance Trading System 428
5. Emission Standards for Hazardous Air Pollutants 430
   a. Section 112 Before the 1990 Amendments 430
      - *Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc. v. Environmental Protection Agency, 824 F.2d 1146 (D.C. Cir. 1987)* 431
   b. Section 112 After the 1990 Amendments 443

i. Designation of Specific Hazardous Air Pollutants 443
ii. Distinguishing Between "Major" and "Area" Sources 444
• *National Mining Association v. Environmental Protection Agency, 59 F.3d 1351 (D.C. Cir. 1995)* 444
iii. Specific Emission Standards According to a Specified Schedule 448
iv. Hazardous Air Pollution Offsets 455
v. Reporting and Prevention of Accidental Chemical Releases 456
6. Enforcement and the Title VI Operating Permits 456

7 The Regulation of Mobile Sources Under the Clean Air Act 461

A. Our Ongoing Love Affair with the Automobile 463
B. The Downside of Automobility 465
C. The Emergence of Air Pollution Legislation for Mobile Sources 468
D. The 1970 Clean Air Act Amendments 469
1. Emission Standards for New Motor Vehicles 471
a. Limits Set by Congress 471
• *International Harvester Co., et al., v. Environmental Protection Agency, 478 F.2d 615 (D.C. Cir. 1973)* 473
b. Additional Limits Set by EPA 490
• *Natural Resources Defense Council v. Environmental Protection Agency, 655 F.2d 318 (D.C. Cir. 1981)* 491
c. Federal Preemption (and the California Exception) 503
2. Regulation of Fuel Content—Product Ban as Technology Forcing 504
• *Ethyl Corp. v. Environmental Protection Agency, 541 F.2d 1 (D.C. Cir. 1976)* 505
3. Transportation Controls and Inspection and Maintenance Programs 523
E. The Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 526
1. Tier I Standards 529
2. Tier II Standards—Uniform Standards for Light-Duty Cars, Trucks, and SUVs 530
3. New Measures Regulating Gasoline 532
4. Encouraging the Use of Alternative Fuels 534
5. Diesel Sulfur, Heavy-Duty Engine, Heavy-Duty Vehicle Rule 536
6. Emissions Rule for Nonroad Engines 538
7. The Mobile Source Air Toxics Program 540

F. Regulation of Fuel Efficiency 541
G. Regulation of Greenhouse Gas Emissions 545
• *Massachusetts, et al. v. Environmental Protection Agency, 127 S. Ct. 1438 (2007)* 547
H. Beyond the Traditional Internal Combustion Engine 568
1. The New Breed of ICEs 569
2. Electric-Drive Vehicles 572
I. The Legacy of the Clean Air Act 576

8 Protection of Surface Waters, Wetlands, and Drinking Water: The Clean Water Act and the Safe Drinking Water Act 579

A. The Clean Water Act: Regulation of Point Source Discharges of Pollutants to Surface Waters, Wetlands, and Sewage Treatment Plants 582
1. The History and Development of the Federal Regulations 582
a. The 1972 Federal Water Pollution Control Act Amendments 583
i. Setting the National Goals 584
ii. The Absolute Prohibition Against Nonconforming Discharges 585
iii. Broad (but Shrinking?) Definition of Navigable Waters 587
• *Rapanos v. United States, 126 S.Ct. 2208 (2006)* 588
iv. The National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) Permit 604
v. National Technology-Based Effluent Limits for Industry 605
vi. Health-Based Effluent Limits for Toxic Pollutants, Set on a Pollutant-by-Pollutant Basis 606
vii. Technology-Based Effluent Limitations and Public Financing for Public Sewage Treatment Plants 607
viii. Federal Pretreatment Standards for Discharges into Municipal Sewage Treatment Plants 607
ix. Ambient Water Quality Standards Set by the States 608
x. Data Generation and Data Disclosure 608
xi. A Strong Emphasis on Public Participation 609
xii. State Involvement in Implementation and Enforcement 611
b. The 1977 Clean Water Act Amendments 612
i. The Division of Pollutants into Three Categories 612
ii. Technology-Based Effluent Limits for Toxic Pollutants 613

- *Wyche, Bradford W., "The Regulation of Toxic Pollutants Under the Clean Water Act: EPA's Ten-Year Rulemaking Nears Completion," from 15 Natural Resources Lawyer 511 (1983)* 614

iii. Relaxation of Deadlines 618

c. The 1987 Water Quality Act Amendments 619

i. A Renewed Emphasis on Water Quality-Based Limitations for Toxic Pollutants 619

ii. An Increased Emphasis on Penalties 620

iii. Relaxation of Deadlines 620

2. The Technology-Based Effluent Limitations in Detail 620

a. Industrial Source Limitations in General 621

- *Dupont v. Train, 430 U.S. 112 (1977)* 621
- *EPA v. National Crushed Stone Association, 449 U.S. 64 (1980)* 633

b. First-Tier Limitations for Existing Sources: BPT 643

c. Second-Tier Limitations for Existing Sources: BCT and BAT 643

d. Limitations for New Sources: BADT 646

e. Limitations for Public Sewage Treatment Plants 648

3. Water Quality-Based Effluent Limitations 648

a. The State and Federal Roles in Setting and Revising Ambient Water Quality Standards 649

b. The Mechanics of Establishing Water Quality Standards 650

c. Translating Ambient Standards into Effluent Limitations 653

i. The Total Maximum Daily Load 653

ii. The Section 304(l) Program for "Toxic Hot Spots" 655

iii. The Mechanics of Establishing Water Quality-Based Effluent Limitations 656

d. Whole Effluent Toxicity Standards 657

4. The Permitting Process in Detail 658

5. Regulation of Stormwater Discharges 661

6. Limitations on Discharges to Public Sewage Treatment Plants 661

7. Regulation of Toxic Chemicals in Sewage Sludge 664

B. The Clean Water Act: Protection of Surface Waters and Wetlands from Nonpoint Source Pollution 664

C. The Clean Water Act: Protection of Surface Waters and Wetlands from the Discharge of Dredged and Fill Material 668

1. The Section 404 Permit Program 670

2. The Application of the Section 404 Program to Wetlands 671

D. The Protection of Public Water Systems: The Safe Drinking Water Act 674
1. The City of New Orleans and the Origins of the Safe Drinking Water Act 675
2. The 1974 Act: Establishing the Framework 676
a. Coverage: Public Water Systems 677
b. Federal Standards: Primary and Secondary Drinking Water Standards 677
c. Notification to Consumers 680
d. State Implementation 680
e. Regulation of Underground Injection Wells 681
3. The 1986 Amendments: Mandating the Maximum Contaminant Levels 682
• *Natural Resources Defense Council v. EPA, 824 F.2d 1211 (D.C. Cir. 1987)* 682
4. The 1996 Amendments: Scaling Back 689

9 Regulation of Hazardous Wastes: RCRA, CERCLA, and Hazardous Waste Facility Siting 693

A. Overview 694
1. Nowhere to Hide: The Relationship Between Hazardous Waste Regulation and Pollution Prevention 694
2. Activist Suburbs: The Revitalization of the Environmental Movement and the Resulting Difficulty in Siting Hazardous Waste Treatment, Storage, and Disposal Facilities 696
3. The "Breakthrough" that Wasn't: Constitutional Limitations on Local Control of Hazardous Waste Shipment and Treatment 699
• *Chemical Waste Management, Inc., v. Guy Hunt, Governor of Alabama, et al., 504 U.S. 334 (1992)* 699
B. The Resource Conservation and Recovery Act (Solid Waste Disposal Act) 708
1. The History and Development of the Federal Regulations 708
2. The Broad Impact: A Federal "Tax" on Hazardous Waste Generation 711
3. The Regulated Materials: Solid and Hazardous Waste 711
a. Solid Waste 712
b. Hazardous Waste 713
i. Characteristic Waste 713
ii. Criteria (Listed) Waste 713

iii. RCRA Definition Waste 714
iv. State Definition Waste 714
v. Ash Generated by Municipal Solid Waste Incinerators 714
• *City of Chicago v. Environmental Defense Fund, 511 U.S. 328 (1994)* 715
4. The "Cradle-to-Grave" System for Hazardous Waste 720
a. Notification and Identification 720
b. The Manifest System 720
c. The Permit Program 720
d. Performance and Monitoring Standards 721
5. The "Land Ban" and the Hazardous Waste Treatment Standards 724
a. A Shift in the Burden of Proof 725
b. The BDAT Standards 725
• *American Petroleum Institute v. United States EPA, 906 F.2d 729 (D.C. Cir. 1990)* 726
6. Standards for Hazardous Waste Incinerators 738
7. Corrective Action and the CAMU 740
8. Underground Storage Tanks 742
9. The Regulation of Other Solid Waste 743
10. The Citizen Suit and Imminent and Substantial Endangerment Provisions 743
• *Dague v. City of Burlington, 935 F.2d 1343 (2d Cir. 1991)* 744
C. The Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act (the Superfund Law) 749
1. Looking Both Ways: The Policy Impact of CERCLA 749
2. The President's Authority to Take, Order, or Contract for the Performance of Cleanup Action under CERCLA 751
a. Section 104 751
b. Section 106 752
3. Standardization and Prioritization 753
a. The National Contingency Plan 753
b. The National Priorities List 753
4. The Nature of Response Actions Under CERCLA 754
a. Removal Action 754
b. Remedial Action 754
i. The Steps of a Remedial Action 755
ii. Cleanup Standards 755
5. The Hazardous Substance Superfund 757

6. The Liability of Responsible Parties to Pay the Cost of Response Action 758
a. Who Is Liable? 758
b. Defenses to Liability 760
c. The Nature of the Liability 761
• *U.S. v. Hercules, Inc., 247 F.3d 706 (8th Cir. 2001)* 762
7. The Special Program for Remediating Federal Facilities 767
8. The Search for Innovative Cleanup Technologies 767
9. The Liability of Responsible Parties to Pay for Damage to Natural Resources 769
10. The Citizen's Role 769
11. Monetary Damages for Personal Injury and Damage to Private Property 770

10 The Right to Know: Mandatory Disclosure of Information Regarding Chemical Risks 771

A. Worker Right to Know 772
1. The OSH Act 775
2. TSCA 777
3. The NLRA 778
B. Community Right to Know 780
1. EPCRA Reporting Generally 781
2. Chemical Release Reporting Under the TRI Program 784
C. Community Right to Know as a Spur to Risk Reduction 788
• *Karkkainen, Bradley C., "Information as Environmental Regulation: TRI and Performance Benchmarking, Precursor to a New Paradigm?," Georgetown Law Journal 257 (2001)* 789

11 Enforcement: Encouraging Compliance with Environmental Statutes 807

A. Overview 807
B. Theories of Enforcement: Compliance, Deterrence, and Restitution 808
C. The Enforcers and their Roles 809
D. Enforcement in Practice: The Proverbial Nuts and Bolts 810
1. Monitoring, Reporting, and Record-Keeping Requirements 810
2. Inspections 810
• *Marshall v. Barlow's Inc., 436 U.S. 307 (1978)* 810
3. Injunctions 816

- *Weinberger, Secretary of Defense, et al. v. Romero-Barcelo et al., 456 U.S. 305 (1982)* 816
- *United States Public Interest Research Group, et al. v. Atlantic Salmon of Maine, LLC, et al., 339 F.3d 23 (1st Cir. 2003)* 827

4. Penalties 834
5. Settlements 836
6. Enforcement Actions Against the Government 838

E. The Special Rules Governing Citizen Enforcement 838

1. Article III Principles: Standing and Mootness 838
   - *Gwaltney of Smithfield, Ltd. v. Chesapeake Bay Foundation, Inc., et al., 484 U.S. 49 (1987)* 841
   - *Friends of the Earth, Inc., et al. v. Laidlaw Environmental Services (TOC), Inc., 528 U.S. 167 (2000)* 852
2. The Relationship between Citizen Enforcement and Government Oversight 873
3. Strategic Lawsuits Against Public Participation (SLAPP Suits) 876

12 Alternative Forms of Government Intervention to Promote Pollution Reduction 879

A. Direct Controls 884
   - *Ashford, Nicholas A., Ayers, Christine and Stone, Robert F., "Using Regulation to Change the Market for Innovation," from Harvard Environmental Law Review (No. 2), pp. 419–466 (1985)* 885

B. Indirect Controls I: "Negative" Incentives 891

1. Emissions Charges 893
2. Tradable Emission Permits 900
   a. Types of Permit Systems 901
   b. Initial Allocation of Permits 902
   c. Other Factors that Influence Trading 903
   d. History, Evidence, and Analysis of Effectiveness of Emissions Trading 905
      - *Burtraw, Dallas and Mansur, "Environmental Effects of SO_2 Trading and Banking," Environmental Science and Technology 33(20): 3489–3494 (1999)* 905
      - *Ellerman, A. Denny, "Are Cap and Trade Programs More Effective in Meeting Environmental Goals than*

Command-and-Control Alternatives?," Charles Kolstad and Jody Freeman (eds.), pp. 48–62 (2006) 907
C. Indirect Controls II: "Positive" Incentives 913
1. Economic Subsidies 914
2. The Coordination of Tax Policy and Environmental Policy 916
3. Other "Positive" Instruments: Information Sharing, Technical Assistance, and Government Purchasing Practices 917
• *Environmental Protection Agency, "Environmentally Preferable Purchasing Program," EPA Report 742-R-99-001, June 1999* 918
D. Liability Standards 920
• *Ashford, Nicholas A. and Stone, Robert F., "Liability, Innovation, and Safety in the Chemical Industry," from The Liability Maze, pp. 392–402 (1991)* 921
E. "Voluntary" Initiatives and Negotiation-Based Strategies 927
1. Overview of Voluntary Initiatives 928
• *Carraro, Carlo and Leveque, Francois, "The Rationale and Potential of Voluntary Approaches," from Voluntary Approaches in Environmental Policy, Kluwer, pp. 1–15 (1999)* 928
2. Public Voluntary Programs: The EPA Experience 934
3. Unilateral Commitments 936
• *Coglianese, Cary and Nash, Jennifer, "Toward a Management-Based Environmental Policy?," from Regulating from the Inside, pp. 222–234 (2001)* 936
a. Self-Enforcement, Environmental Management Systems, and Industry Codes 936
• *Gouldson, A. and Murphy, J., "Voluntary Regulation and the European Union's Eco-Management and Audit System," from Regulatory Realities, pp. 54–69 (1998)* 942
b. Industrial Ecology as a Special Example of Unilateral Commitments 948
• *Ashford, N. A., "Overview of the Special Issue on Industrial Ecology," from Journal of Cleaner Production, 5(1|2), pp. i–iv (1997)* 949
4. Negotiated Outcomes 951
• *Ashford, N. A., and Caldart, Charles C., "Negotiated Regulation, Implementation and*

Compliance in the United States," from The Handbook of Voluntary Agreements, pp. 135–159 (2005) 951
- *Caldart, Charles C. and Ashford, N. A., "Negotiation as a Means of Developing and Implementing Environmental and Occupational Health and Safety Policy," from Harvard Environmental Law Review 141 (1999)* 953

References 962

13 Policies to Promote Pollution Prevention and Inherent Safety 967

A. Background 968
1. The Limits of Traditional Pollution Control and the Emergence of Pollution Prevention 968
   - *Strasser, Kurt, "Cleaner Technology, Pollution Prevention and Environmental Regulation," Fordham Environmental Law Journal 1 (1997)* 970
2. The Winds of Change: Dissatisfaction with End-of-Pipe Regulatory Approaches 975
   - *Ashford, N. A., "Pollution Prevention: A New Ethic or New Rhetoric?," from Environmental Strategies for Industry: International Perspectives on Research Needs and Policy Implications, pp. 277–307 (1993)* 976
3. Industrial Ecology as a Competing Paradigm to Pollution Prevention 978
   - *Oldenburg, K. and Geiser, K. "Pollution Prevention and . . . or Industrial Ecology?," from Journal of Cleaner Production 5(2): 103–108 (1997)* 978

B. Chemical Accident Prevention and Its Relationship to Pollution Prevention 986
1. The Nature of Chemical Accidents 987
   - *Ashford, Nicholas A., Gobbell, James Victor, Lachman, Judith, Matthiesen, Minzner, Mary Ann and Stone, Robert, "The Encouragement of Technological Change for Preventing Chemical Accidents: Moving Firms from Secondary Prevention and Mitigation to Primary Prevention," Report to the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Center for Technology, Policy and Industrial Development at MIT (July 1993)* 987

2. Chemical Safety and Accident Prevention: Inherent Safety and Inherently Safer Production 998
• *Ashford, Nicholas A. and Zwetsloot, Gerard, "Encouraging Inherently Safer Production in European Firms: A Report from the Field," Journal of Hazardous Materials, 78(1–3): 123–144 (1999)* 999
3. The Enhanced Need for Inherent Safety after 9/11 1005
C. Moving from Characterizing Problems and Assessing Risk to Finding Technology-Based Solutions 1009
1. The Technology Options Analysis 1009
2. The U.S. Experience 1011
3. The European Experience: The Cleaner Technology Movement and Ecological Modernization 1012
D. U.S. and European Union Legislation Focusing on Pollution and Accident Prevention 1014
1. The Pollution Prevention Act 1014
2. The Chemical Safety Provisions of the Clean Air Act 1017
a. General Provisions 1017
b. OSHA's Process Safety Management Standard 1019
c. EPA's Risk Management Plan Regulation 1020
3. The Massachusetts Toxics Use Reduction Act 1021
• *Karkkainen, Bradley C., "Information as Environmental Regulation: TRI and Performance Benchmarking, Precursor to a New Paradigm?," Georgetown Law Journal 257 (2001)* 1022
• *Coglianese, Cary and Nash, Jennnifer, "Policy Options for Improving Environmental Management," Environment 44(9): 13–22 (2002)* 1024
4. Coordinating Accident Prevention with Pollution Prevention 1027
5. European Union Legislation 1028
a. The Integrated Pollution Prevention and Control Directive 1028
b. The Seveso Directives 1028
E. Using Traditional Environmental Statutes to Encourage Pollution and Accident Prevention 1029
1. Stringent Standards 1030
2. Innovation Waivers 1030
• *Monsanto Company v. Environmental Protection Agency, 19 F.3d 1201 (7th Cir. 1994)* 1031
3. EPA's Supplemental Environmental Project (SEP) Program 1033

• *Caldart, Charles C. and Ashford, Nicholas A., "Negotiation as a Means of Developing and Implementing Environmental and Occupational Health and Safety Policy," Harvard Environmental Law Review 141 (1999)* 1033

F. Worker and Citizen Involvement in Pollution Prevention and Technology Choices 1035

• *Ashford, Nicholas A., "Industrial Safety: The Neglected Issue in Industrial Ecology," Journal of Cleaner Production, Special Issue on Industrial Ecology, 5(1|2): i–iv, March–June (1997)* 1036

References 1040

14 Epilogue—Beyond Pollution Control and Prevention: Sustainable Development 1043

A. The Unsustainable Industrial State 1044

B. Conceptualizations of Sustainable Development 1046

C. Incremental Change by Incumbent Firms Is Inadequate for Achieving Sustainability 1048

D. The Role of Government 1050

About the Authors 1053

Index of Cases 1055

Subject Index 1061