

The Primacy of Grammar

Nirmalangshu Mukherji

**A Bradford Book
The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England**

© 2010 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

MIT Press books may be purchased at special quantity discounts for business or sales promotional use. For information, please e-mail special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu or write to Special Sales Department, The MIT Press, 55 Hayward Street, Cambridge, MA 02142.

This book was set in Times New Roman and Syntax on 3B2 by Asco Typesetters, Hong Kong. Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Mukherji, Nirmalangshu.

The primacy of grammar / Nirmalangshu Mukherji.

p. cm.

“A Bradford book.”

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-01405-2 (hardcover : alk. paper)

1. Bilingualism. 2. Language and languages—Philosophy. I. Title.

P132.M85 2010

401—dc22

2009031988

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Contents

List of Figures	xi
Abbreviations	xiii
Preface	xv
1	The Loneliness of Bilingualism 1
1.1	Some Classical Issues 2
1.2	Limits of Cognitive Inquiry 4
1.3	Overview of Bilingualism 11
1.3.1	Language and Biology 13
1.3.2	A Body of Doctrines 19
1.3.3	A Mind-Internal System 24
2	Linguistic Theory I 29
2.1	Russell's Scope Problem 30
2.2	Principles and Parameters 35
2.3	Government-Binding Theory 37
2.3.1	D-Structure 39
2.3.1.1	<i>C-Selection</i> 40
2.3.1.2	<i>X-Bar Theory</i> 43
2.3.1.3	<i>Theta Theory</i> 47
2.3.2	S-Structure 51
2.3.2.1	<i>Case Theory</i> 52
2.3.2.2	<i>Wh-Movement</i> 55
2.3.2.3	<i>Binding Theory</i> 57
2.3.3	LF 62
2.4	Grammar and Scope Problem 66
3	Grammar and Logic 73
3.1	Chinese Room 74
3.2	PFR and SFR 75
3.3	LF and Logical Form 83
3.4	Truth and Meaning 87
3.5	Limits of Formal Semantics 95

3.5.1	External Significance	95
3.5.2	Syntax of Thought?	100
3.5.3	Russell's Equivalence	106
3.6	Summing Up	115
4	Words and Concepts	119
4.1	"Incompleteness" of Grammar	119
4.2	Lexical Data	124
4.2.1	Uncertain Intuitions	126
4.2.2	Nature of Lexical Inquiry	132
4.3	Lexical Decomposition	134
4.3.1	Initial Objections	136
4.3.2	Nouns	145
4.3.3	Verbs	150
4.4	Crossroads	156
5	Linguistic Theory II	161
5.1	Minimalist Program	162
5.1.1	Conceptual Necessity	163
5.1.2	Feature Checking	165
5.1.3	(New) Merge	169
	5.1.3.1 <i>Merge and Syntax</i>	171
	5.1.3.2 <i>Merge and Semantics</i>	173
5.1.4	Economy Principles	176
5.2	C _{HL} and Linguistic Specificity	179
5.2.1	Principles	182
5.2.2	Displacement	185
6	Language and Music	189
6.1	Musilanguage Hypothesis	189
6.1.1	Evidence	190
6.1.2	What the Evidence Means	194
6.2	Strong Musilanguage Hypothesis	197
6.2.1	Music and Meaning	198
6.2.2	Themes from Wittgenstein	201
	6.2.2.1 <i>Music and Emotions</i>	202
	6.2.2.2 <i>Internal Significance</i>	205
6.2.3	Recursion in Music	209
7	A Joint of Nature	215
7.1	Merge and Music	216
7.2	Faculty of Music	222
7.3	"Laws of Nature"	229
7.3.1	Forms of Explanation	229
7.3.2	Scope of Computationalism	235

Notes	243
References	253
Index	271